

BRITISH BROADCASTING CORPORATION

RADIO 4

TRANSCRIPT OF "FILE ON 4" – "*THE SECRETS OF SMYLLUM PARK*"

CURRENT AFFAIRS GROUP

TRANSMISSION:	Tuesday 12 <sup>th</sup> September 2017	2000 – 2040
REPEAT:	Sunday 17 <sup>th</sup> September 2017	1700 - 1740

REPORTER:	Michael Buchanan
PRODUCER:	Ben Robinson
EDITOR:	Gail Champion

PROGRAMME NUMBER:	PEM46000660/AAA
-------------------	-----------------

THE ATTACHED TRANSCRIPT WAS TYPED FROM A RECORDING AND NOT COPIED FROM AN ORIGINAL SCRIPT. BECAUSE OF THE RISK OF MISHEARING AND THE DIFFICULTY IN SOME CASES OF IDENTIFYING INDIVIDUAL SPEAKERS, THE BBC CANNOT VOUCH FOR ITS COMPLETE ACCURACY.

“FILE ON 4”

Transmission: Tuesday 12<sup>th</sup> September 2017

Repeat: Sunday 17<sup>th</sup> September 2017

Producer: Ben Robinson

Reporter: Michael Buchanan

Editor: Gail Champion

---

MUSIC ‘AVE VERUM CORPUS’

DOCHERTY: I was first brought here 10<sup>th</sup> March 1954. First time I seen a nun in their habits, with their big white seagull hats. She just booted into my face, wee black leather boots that they wore. She was kicking my face, kicking my body, and when I looked up, I seen the hate in her face, and this big white hat. And for 19 months that woman made my life hell.

MUSIC CONTINUES

BUCHANAN: Smyllum Park Orphanage in Lanarkshire closed its doors in 1981, but the Catholic nuns that ran it stand accused by former residents of violently abusing those in their care and dumping the bodies of the dead in unmarked graves.

QUINN: Well, I stood here and I had to ask, where is the graves, the kids’ graves? She says, ‘George, you are standing on it.’ You would never have thought anybody was buried here – never.

BUCHANAN: It’s hard to think that we are effectively standing on a mass grave.

QUINN: It's sad, it's [sigh]. I can't even put it into words how I feel about the children. I feel so sad for them, the lives they had. There's no affection, there's no compassion and there's certainly no love for the children of Smyllum.

BUCHANAN: Tonight, we reveal multiple failures by the Catholic order, the Daughters of Charity of St Vincent de Paul, and answer the question they've long ignored – how many children died at Smyllum and where are they buried.

#### ACTUALITY WITH PICTURE

MCCOLL: ... character ...

BUCHANAN: That's a picture of you dressed as Superman?

MCCOLL: Aye, because I was doing five jobs.

BUCHANAN: You used to do five jobs?

MCCOLL: Five jobs a day.

BUCHANAN: What were the jobs?

MCCOLL: Two cleaning in the morning, my main job in the hotel and then two cleaning jobs in the weekend. So I was away from half seven in the morning to half eleven at night.

BUCHANAN: No wonder you were known as Superman.

MCCOLL: You have to pay the bills somehow.

BUCHANAN: Eddie McColl has a more relaxed life now. He's in his early 70s, a widower, a proud grandfather and great-grandfather. His start in life, however, wasn't great – he ended up at the Smyllum care home in Lanark, which was run by Catholic nuns.

BUCHANAN cont: What do you remember of going in there?

MCCOLL: Everything was all right until my father died.  
Pneumonia. And my mum couldn't handle us all, you know, so that's what happened, we got taken off her.

BUCHANAN: How many of you were there?

MCCOLL: At that time me, Francis, Stephen, John.

BUCHANAN: What was Smyllum Park like?

MCCOLL: Hell. Hell.

BUCHANAN: Recalling his childhood, even now, Eddie gets agitated, taps the table, flusters slightly.

MCCOLL: You were getting punished all the time, you know, for anything, the slightest thing. But at the time when we were in there at that age, we were thinking that's happening to every child, thinking it's just normal, you know. She would have you there, lining up in four rows in the hall with a big stick and have you up there and hit you across the knuckles. If you pulled away, she would keep hitting you until you stopped pulling away, even if your knuckle was bleeding.

BUCHANAN: This was a nun?

MCCOLL: Well, it was the head sister. She was really to me violent, you know, and then she would walk about with a big leather belt down the side there and just hit us across the back of the knees and things like that.

BUCHANAN: Can you see her now?

MCCOLL: Yes, definitely, aye. I can see the cane and the belt hanging at her side. She used to take us into the office and that - drop your trousers and lean you over the desk and belt you.

BUCHANAN: A very harsh environment?

MCCOLL: It was, it was. I feel as if I've lost my youth, you know, my childhood. I feel as if I never had a childhood actually. You're bringing back a lot of bad memories here actually. Not thought of that for a while. I just feel I've not had a childhood.

BUCHANAN: Eddie spent almost a decade in Smyllum, leaving in about 1958. His younger brother, Francis, remained however. So this picture of Francis is him sprawled on the floor, playing with some cars.

MCCOLL: Enjoying himself. He's just a normal kid.

BUCHANAN: Enjoying himself. Around him are a good number of other boys and they're all quite well dressed.

MCCOLL: They all look satisfied and well looked after, like, you know.

BUCHANAN: It looks incredibly normal, doesn't it?

MCCOLL: Yes, exactly, as if they are just thoroughly enjoying themselves, you know. That's the way you should see kids anyway.

BUCHANAN: The reality was very different.

MCCOLL: A lot of baloney, a lot of baloney.

BUCHANAN: Eddie is now showing me the only photo he has of Francis. He's about nine in the picture, he says, and went into Smyllum like all the rest of them in the late 1940s. Eddie used to pop back to visit him, but a trip in 1961 sticks out. He was shocked to be told that Francis wasn't at Smyllum, there had been an accident.

MCCOLL: It was when I visited once, you know, because I wanted to see him, you know, and they told me he was not here, he was in hospital, and that's all they would tell us.

BUCHANAN: Did they tell you which hospital?

MCCOLL: They didn't tell us what hospital. In all these years we've been told, they're not sure if it was the Royal or in Glasgow's hospital or Edinburgh hospital.

BUCHANAN: So how many years have you been trying to find out what happened?

MCCOLL: Lots of years now. It's been a long time, very long time.

BUCHANAN: For years you didn't know what had happened to him and you didn't know where he was buried?

MCCOLL: No, didn't know where or even if he was still alive. Didn't know that at all.

BUCHANAN: Did you believe he might still be alive?

MCCOLL: Well, yes I did actually. But I didn't get any information, they wouldn't tell us nothing except he wasn't there and that he was away at hospital and they wouldn't tell us what happened, but we heard through time that he got hit in the head with a golf club.

BUCHANAN: Despite Eddie's one time hope that Francis was alive, it does seem as though he may have died. But how he died, where he died, and where he might be buried remained a mystery to Eddie. Frustrated by his own efforts, he contacted a group called INCAS, In Care Abuse Survivors. The group had been set up by Frank Docherty, himself a former Smyllum resident, who was on a quest to find out what had happened to the children of Smyllum.

#### EXTRACT FROM FRANK DOCHERTY RECORDING

DOCHERTY: We never knew this place existed and my friend Jimmy Kane was down here one day, and he was talking to the gardeners, and it was the gardeners that told him this is where the Smyllum children were buried.

BUCHANAN: That's Frank Docherty in a home video recorded at St Mary's Catholic cemetery in Lanark. Away from the manicured and precise graves of the nuns, Frank and his friend Jimmy Kane had found a mass grave in a forgotten, unloved corner of the graveyard.

DOCHERTY: This came as a total surprise. And when we came to see it, it was a terrible mess; terrible, terrible mess. It was overgrown, the grass hadn't been touched, there was a load of rubbish piled in that corner there. The nuns' graves and the priests' graves was all kept in the best of repair, clean, tidy, grass cut, edges done and all the rubbish from there was dumped on here. Through this here, it came to be that this is their shame and they buried their shame for all these years. Now I had to do something about it.

BUCHANAN: Discovering the burial plot was one thing; finding out how many children are in it, something else. The group did the obvious thing – they asked the nuns. But the Daughters of Charity said their records were poor. After some further pressure, the group say the nuns told them there were children buried in 158 compartments in the plot. But in the video, Frank's determination is apparent. The lack of records – and the nuns' reluctance to engage - convinced him the numbers were far larger.

DOCHERTY: Kids, unidentifiable, can't be found. There's something wrong. We'll keep going until we get to the bottom of this.

BUCHANAN: INCAS started writing to everyone – nuns, priests, bishops, archbishops, lawyers, doctors, politicians – with one basic question: which children are buried in that grave? Unfortunately Frank Docherty never got his answer – he died suddenly in April, just a month before he was due to be the first witness to give evidence to the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry. His relentless campaigning to highlight abuse in care homes had contributed hugely to the establishment of the inquiry, which is going to closely examine what happened at Smyllum. Frank's widow, Janet, says it was one of his proudest achievements.

JANET DOCHERTY: That was his goal in life, to get a public inquiry, to be heard, to make sure that people out there knew what had happened to kids and they weren't just shunning it off. And that was his goal, and that was his full life was INCAS. It's just been nearly twenty years of Frank slowly chipping away, just slowly chipping away.

BUCHANAN: Janet has taken on Frank's campaigning mantle, ensuring survivors are supported and the dead aren't forgotten. Living with a man who'd devoted the final two decades of his life to unveiling the truth, to naming the dead, seeing his resilience and resourcefulness, walking away wasn't an option. When he was writing these letters and the archbishops and the Catholic Church weren't responding to him, did it anger him or did it spur him on?

JANET DOCHERTY: It made him move on. A lot of it upset him because all the letters are in there from different bishops, cardinals, etc, and one of them says, 'We're sorry what you incurred and what happened to you when you were a child, but my best suggestion, I can't help you but I would just say move on with your life.' You know things like that, he was getting responses like that. He was like that, no chance. No way.

BUCHANAN: So when he's asked for records, what have they said to him?



JANET DOCHERTY: They were destroyed by fire or there was a leak, they were burned, they moved premises and a lot of them got lost, etc, do you know what I mean? So you weren't getting anywhere, it was like bouncing your head off a wall, he wasn't getting anywhere with the final numbers.

BUCHANAN: Did he believe them?

JANET DOCHERTY: Not at all, no, no

.

BUCHANAN: We therefore set off to complete the work that consumed Frank Docherty's later years. Working in conjunction with the Sunday Post newspaper, we approached the Daughters of Charity and asked them if we could get their admissions book for Smyllum. If we could find out who went in, we could research what had happened to them. The sisters however said no, you can't have it, as it contains personal data on individuals. Somewhat stymied, we turned to a woman who had made headlines around the world when she uncovered a mass grave in Ireland.

#### ARCHIVE NEWS EXTRACTS

NEWSREADER: The time is now twenty to eight. Ireland's Prime Minister, Enda Kenny, has promised an investigation into a mass grave believed to contain the remains of almost 800 babies, which was discovered near a Catholic home for unmarried mothers. A local historian, Catherine Corless, says her study of death records suggests ....

NEWSREADER 2: Officials in Ireland say significant quantities of human remains have been discovered in a mass grave at a former orphanage ...

BUCHANAN: Catherine Corless is an amateur historian in the west of Ireland, who in 2014 revealed that nearly 800 children had died at a maternity home run by nuns in Tuam, County Galway. Her investigations, she believed, showed the dead were buried in a mass grave on the edge of a housing estate. So the first question for Catherine – how did her research begin?

CORLESS: I wouldn't have got this far without hard facts, just evidence. Absolutely need evidence to show what you're talking about, because nobody wants to hear you in the first place, or nobody wants to go back there, because I've been told it's a long time ago, forget about it more or less. You needed a death certificate to prove that a child has died. Now whether the sisters kept the death records is another question. You just need the evidence in your hands, you need paper in your hands to say this child died, where is this child? Where is this child buried? Where is this little body?

BUCHANAN: Based on your work, what we should do is get the death certificates, approach the nuns to see if they can tell us where the people were buried ...

CORLESS: Yes, with a little bit of pressure the next time to say that they're looking into this and just to delve deeper and see are there more records. We have to account for every child that died in your home, in your care. You really need the death certs, there's no argument.

#### ACTUALITY IN EDINBURGH

BUCHANAN: So, taking Catherine's advice, I've come to Edinburgh, specifically just off Princes Street, and the headquarters of the National Records of Scotland. Here, they hold death records going back to 1855. Digging them out, however, is no job for a novice like me, so we've engaged an archivist, Janet Bishop, to search for us. Our request is this – find the death record of every person under the age of 18 whose usual place of residence when they died, or whose actual place of death, was Smyllum Park Orphanage. While Janet does that, I'm off to meet some other former residents.

#### ACTUALITY APPROACHING SMYLLUM

BUCHANAN: This lane takes us down towards Smyllum. Can you remember what it was like approaching it the first day you came here?

QUINN: It's a very imposing structure. And then to open the door, you meet these nuns with the white headdress on and things like that, you've not had any dealings with the nuns, so you then step back a step and go, what's this? I suppose I was

QUINN cont: a bit in awe of it because it was such a big ... the turrets and things, it was like a medieval castle to me.

BUCHANAN: I went for a walk around what remains of the care home with George Quinn, who first came to Smyllum in 1960 and stayed here for the following six years. Much of Smyllum is now modern housing. Only the original entrance hall, with its turrets and double length windows, actually remains. Back in the day, however, it was a sprawling campus of dormitories with a school and a church, of course. George did need help – both his parents were alcoholics and couldn't cope. He told me earlier he was something of a street urchin. But while Smyllum offered him shelter, it didn't offer him care. Was there any delight at all in coming to an environment where at least you were fed, you were watered, there was shelter, there was structure?

QUINN: Well, the first thing you got was clothes - vests and underpants. I had never had them before, so you think you're a wee ... God, I've got clothes now. They were quite good with that. But once the beatings started and then the discipline started, it's a Catch 22. You had somewhere to sleep, you were out of the shelter out of the weather, but I got more love staying with my mum for the state she was in with alcohol than I ever did, there was nothing here.

BUCHANAN: Would you have swapped what was happening here to go back to your mother and all the chaos that was there?

QUINN: In a heartbeat I would have been back to my mother, yeah, without food, without things like that, yeah.

BUCHANAN: George admits he was cheeky, and maybe some of the smacks he received were merited – it was the 1960s after all and corporal punishment, even in loving homes, was widely used. But what he experienced was unacceptable by any standards, particularly what happened at the hands of the caretaker, a man called Charles Forsyth.

MUSIC: CLIFF RICHARD 'LIVING DOLL'

BUCHANAN: George and his friends were meant to be practising for a Christmas concert. Instead, however, they were messing about, listening to a radio that George's father had recently bought him. Charles Forsyth walked in.

QUINN: I remember Cliff Richard was on and we were all just dancing and messing about. I think I might have been about eight at this time. Charlie Forsyth came in – 'What's this rubbish you're listening to?' and I says, 'Oh, it's Cliff Richard, he's good,' and he turned it off. I says, 'What's up with Cliff Richard?' 'He's not a singer,' and I says, 'Well, who do you like?' and he says it was Andy Stewart, and I burst out laughing. He just lost the plot, he just first of all he picked up the radio and smashed it against the wall and then he just started beating into me as if he was beating into another man rather than a boy. I remember getting punched and kicked and then I fell on the floor and I just curled up in a ball and he was still kicking me. Whether there was a ... there, I don't remember, I must have lost consciousness.

BUCHANAN: Where was he hitting you?

QUINN: I was getting kicked in the head and the back, especially the back, but I was covering my head with my hands as well. My body was covered in bruises. I was completely bamboozled but then shocked.

BUCHANAN: What were you thinking?

QUINN: Pure fear. I think I probably wet myself, I can't say if I did or not, but it was just terror, absolute terror. It was probably a godsend that I did get, lose consciousness. There must have been blood all over the place as well, because my face, when I woke up, I couldn't believe the mess I was in. I was in such a horrible state. My face was all puffed out and my nose was bloody, I couldn't move my arms and my legs because they were so sore.

BUCHANAN: George Quinn spent three weeks in a recovery area of the care home, convalescing after Forsyth's beating, with nuns tending to him, but never talking about what had happened. He considers what he experienced to have been nothing less than attempted murder. George wasn't alone. Some other former residents have also

BUCHANAN cont:                      told us they were attacked by Charles Forsyth. We asked the Daughters of Charity if they'd any records of any incidents involving the caretaker - they didn't respond. Charles Forsyth died in 1983.

## MUSIC

READER 1: Thomas O'Neill, age 12, June 12<sup>th</sup> ....

READER 2: Margaret Mulhearn, age 2, November 14<sup>th</sup> ...

READER 3: Hannah Phillips, age 14, April 21<sup>st</sup> .....

BUCHANAN: By now, Janet Bishop's work was beginning to bear fruit. The archivist started to send through the names of children whose death certificates showed they'd been living at Smyllum at the time of their death. Dozens of names, their ages, when they died.

READER 4: Inna McNeish, age 16, September 6<sup>th</sup> ....

READER 5: Rose Lavery, age 4, November 19<sup>th</sup> ....

READER 6: Ellen McCann, aged 1, March 10<sup>th</sup> ....

READER 7: Patrick Johnston, age 1, May 6<sup>th</sup> ...

READER 8: James Smith, age 14, June 1<sup>st</sup> ....

BUCHANAN: The certificates reveal that most of the children died aged 15 or under between 1870 and 1930. The deaths were usually recorded as being of natural causes - conditions like pneumonia, TB and pleurisy, illnesses that would have been common across Scotland in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century. Simon Collins, the lawyer for the INCAS group, says however that does not diminish the importance of unveiling what happened.

COLLINS: If there are children dying in care homes and their deaths are not being recorded and marked, then there will always be concerns about why that is the case. There are also unavoidably the events that are described from living memory from survivors of Smyllum, which suggests that whilst perhaps for the vast majority of the children that were buried, there were death certificates, which confirm natural causes or natural illnesses, there are suspicions and very real concerns amongst those who were present that that was not always the correct story and that more was happening.

BUCHANAN: Everybody accepts the vast majority died of natural causes. So your point, I suppose, is not so much that these children died at Smyllum, it's the manner in which their deaths were recorded and the fact that they weren't given a recognition of a life.

COLLINS: That, I suppose, is the concern, that if in death they are treated with a degree of disdain or treated as a commodity that has expired, then that supports the concerns that are raised by survivors that the children were not being afforded the appropriate level of care during their lives.

BUCHANAN: Marie Peachey would strongly agree. She was in Smyllum at the same time as George Quinn, throughout much of the 1960s, though they never knowingly met. Like too many other former residents, she suffered abuse, both physical and psychological.

PEACHEY: They would laugh and say horrible things to you. They said my mum was a prostitute and my dad was a gangster, we'll never see them again and we're going to die there. Constantly. Just nobody wants you, that's why you are here.

BUCHANAN: Marie survived the whole experience – just – but has long wondered if one other boy in particular did. It's 1969, and like Francis McColl eight years earlier, there's an incident with a golf club.

PEACHEY: We were outside playing golf - me, my sister and my brother and a couple of other boys and girls - and my sister said, 'Look, we'd better go because they'll start shouting at us to get in,' so she went to turn and we heard a scream, and

PEACHEY cont: she turned round quite fast and she went, ‘Don’t look, don’t look!’ Obviously you look, and a boy was lying on the ground. The nun was on the grass as well, checking him. You could see blood, no movement, no nothing. And then the handyman came out and he took the golf stick, went in the shed with it and then we were back in and then we never seen him again.

BUCHANAN: You never saw who? The boy?

PEACHEY: We never seen the boy again, no.

BUCHANAN: Did you not ask anybody what happened to him?

PEACHEY: Like the other children?

BUCHANAN: Other children, even the nuns?

PEACHEY: Why would we ask anybody? They would just slap us if we asked anything. We never seen him again, that was it.

BUCHANAN: We don't know what happened to that boy – Marie can't remember his name, but is adamant he was never seen again. We asked the Daughters of Charity about the incident. Once more, they didn't reply to our question. The boy may have died, though our research did not find a death at Smyllum in 1969. He may simply have been moved elsewhere – some former residents have spoken of leaving the care home at a moment's notice.

READER 1: John Scotland, age 7 months, November ...

READER 2: Rebecca Connelly, age 14, March 30<sup>th</sup> ....

READER 3: Neil McGinty, aged 14 ....

READER 4: Margaret Potts, age 1 ...

READER 5: Katherine Foley, age 6 ...

READER 6: Thomas McCreadie, aged 8 months ....

READER 7: Eve McDermott, age 1 ...

READER 8: Benjamin McCoy, age 2 ...

READER 9: Joseph McNulty, aged 8, September ....

READER 10: Anthony Henry, age 7, April 14<sup>th</sup> 1932 ...

BUCHANAN: By now, we're being overwhelmed with names, dozens and dozens of death certificates are coming through. On our list is the name of Francis McColl – confirmation that he had indeed died. We gave the news to his brother, Eddie. We've managed to dig out his post mortem result. So after Francis died, there was a post mortem done. This is from the National Records of Scotland Office and they say that Francis McColl was 13 years old, he was male and that he died on 12<sup>th</sup> August 1961 around 10.20 in the evening at the Royal Infirmary in Edinburgh. So now we know where he died.

MCCOLL: Yes, that helps a bit.

BUCHANAN: Now it goes on to say what caused his death, and technically it says it was a left extradural haemorrhage – that essentially is a brain haemorrhage, and then in brackets underneath it, it says 'accidental'.

MCCOLL: Well a golf club would do that, like, you know. I always believed he'd been hit in the head with a golf club. He'd been asked to step back and he was the only one that didn't step back, and he got hit in the side of the head.

BUCHANAN: We'll never know if Francis McColl was indeed hit on the head with a golf club, or if that was what killed him. But his name was one of not dozens, but hundreds of people who died at Smyllum. Our research revealed that at least 402 children had died at the care home between 1864 and 1981. Our next question was where are



BUCHANAN cont: they all buried? We checked with the local council for Lanark – South Lanarkshire - who hold burial records for the area. They told us they didn't have any. So we went through our list again, and noticed that some of the children had been sent to Smyllum from other places across central Scotland, so we did some spot checks on burial records from other areas. That threw up evidence that two of the children had been buried in Glasgow. But that was it; no other area we approached could find any burial record for the many names we asked them to check. Time, we thought, to get advice once more from Irish historian, Catherine Corless.

In our case, we have the death certificates, the lack of burial records and a previous admission from the nuns that the bodies are in this ground, so we can safely conclude, based on your research, can we, that the other children are buried in this same cemetery?

CORLESS: They have to be. There's no other answer and I do believe it's a replica of Tuam, isn't it?

BUCHANAN: So based on your experience of Tuam, what you would conclude is that the people who we believe may well be buried at St Mary's Cemetery in Lanark are probably buried in an unmarked grave at that cemetery?

CORLESS: I would totally believe that. You may find one or two exceptions, but as regards the little ones whose mothers were gone and nobody knew about them or nobody cared, I would believe that they would be just discarded the same as the Tuam babies.

BUCHANAN: It's awful to think that the Catholic church, the Daughters of Charity, would have been engaged in this kind of practice.

CORLESS: I know. I just, like Tuam, I can't get my head around it. I think the saddest thing of all, how the church and the nuns, they just don't seem to care, they want us to go away, that's the attitude and that's why I'm just not shocked at anything anymore.

BUCHANAN: To recap, the INCAS group said the Daughters of Charity had told them that children were buried in 158 compartments in an unmarked plot of land at St Mary's Cemetery. Our research indicates, however, that the number is far higher. Based on the existence of death records but the absence of burial records, we believe at least 400 children who died at Smyllum are buried in a mass grave in Lanark. We went to see Janet Docherty, whose husband Frank had devoted so much time and effort to honouring the dead.

We've been doing some work to try and understand how many children might be buried at St Mary's, and the figure that we have come to is over four hundred.

JANET DOCHERTY: Oh my God, I have got goose pimples. Shocking, shocking for kids. Four hundred, you know what I mean? If Frank was alive, it would blow him off his chair. Because as you said, he'd been trying for years to find a figure and didn't get anywhere. That's unbelievable, by the way. Terrible. And they are still hiding behind the cloth, the chapel, churches, whatever it is, you know what I mean.

BUCHANAN: What do you think Frank would have made of the four hundred figure?

JANET DOCHERTY: He just wanted to be heard, a voice for the kids, that's what it was. He just wanted folk to believe them, what they went through, basically because they are still in denial. Open up your hearts, tell the folk, yeah, we know abuse took place and we will change it for kids in the future, and admit and accept what the Catholic Church and the other organisations have done to these kids. Get it out and let people just live the rest of their life in peace, get rid of their demons and have a wee happy life to live to the end of their lives – that's it.

MUSIC – AMAZING GRACE

ACTUALITY AT CEMETERY

BUCHANAN: Each year, the survivors of Smyllum and their families gather at St Mary's to remember the children who died at the care home.

MINISTER: Join together in spirit all the children laid within these plots today. We ask you to touch each and every one of our hearts ....

BUCHANAN: This year, despite the torrential rain, the ceremony had an added poignancy as the ashes of Frank Docherty were scattered over the mass grave he had worked so hard to uncover; his final resting place – appropriately – among the children of Smyllum. In attendance last month, for the first time, was George Quinn, who I caught up with later.

QUINN: Well, I stood here and I had to ask, where is the graves, the kids' graves? She says, 'George, you are standing on it.' You would never have thought anybody was buried here – never.

BUCHANAN: It's hard to think that we are effectively standing on a mass grave.

QUINN: It's sad, it's [sigh]. I can't even put it into words how I feel about the children. I feel so sad for them, the lives they had. There's no affection, there's no compassion and there's certainly no love for the children of Smyllum. The guy that beat me up, Charlie Forsyth, he's, what, ten feet away. His headstone is there.

BUCHANAN: Let's walk over to where it is then. It is amongst the graves for the children.

QUINN: Yes, it's actually amongst the graves. That to me is a final insult. He shouldn't be anywhere near them. It's just ... I look at the grave and I just feel hate for the man. It's actually quite, quite emotional, that's the only word I could put on it just now. That he's anywhere near these wee kids. And then the other ironic thing is, if I look round to my right, you see all the headstones for the nuns that's there and they're all beautifully carved and beautifully named and dated when they died.

BUCHANAN: Can you begin to possibly understand why Charles Forsyth, who almost killed you, and according to other people that we've spoken to, also

BUCHANAN cont:                      carried out attacks on other children, can you begin to possibly understand why on earth he is buried among the graves of the children?

QUINN: I wonder if it's the final insult, I really do. I mean, Frank Docherty had been fighting this for the best part of twenty years. They've had more doors shut in their face, the Catholic faith denying everything, so why not just put his headstone in amongst the children? It's as if they've just washed their hands of us completely. Why he's here - the mind boggles why he's even here.

BUCHANAN: We did, of course, ask the Daughters of Charity why Charles Forsyth had been buried among the children, the only headstone in that section of the graveyard. Again, indeed, they didn't answer. In fact, we asked the nuns many questions – including, of course, their reaction to our finding of hundreds of children being buried at St Mary's. They didn't respond directly to any of them, beyond saying no, they wouldn't give us an interview. The essence of what they did say was that they are fully cooperating with the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry and that that is the best and most appropriate forum to investigate what happened at Smyllum. They went on to say that the values of the Daughters of Charity are totally against any form of abuse and offered their most sincere and heartfelt apology to anyone who suffered any form of abuse whilst in their care.

The majority of sisters at the care home were neither abusive nor uncaring – most former residents have emphasised that to us. But a minority were, and what happened at Smyllum over decades – either at the hands of nuns or with their complicity – will forever stain the name of the Daughters of Charity of St Vincent de Paul. But Smyllum was, of course, just one care home run by the Catholic Church, and Professor Michael Lamb – a former member of the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry - has grave fears following our findings.

LAMB: It's really awful to believe that those kinds of events were happening, you know, not only 150 years ago, but up to and during my lifetime. It does raise questions and make me wonder how widespread that was, how many other institutions were doing this. You know, to me, it does make me wonder, in some of the very large institutions, was this a pattern? If this number of children were dying at a relatively small institution, what were the rates of death at some of the other institutions? Were they similarly disposing of bodies?

BUCHANAN: So why does any of this matter? The children are, after all, long dead and buried. The abuse – while unacceptable – happened decades ago, when we know children were treated far more harshly than they are today. The Scottish Catholic Church told us, for instance, that they'd issued a number of apologies over recent years to anyone who'd suffered any form of abuse at the hands of those representing the church. But speak to enough former residents of Smyllum - Marie Peachey for instance - and you hear a burning sense of injustice, a determination to right a wrong.

PEACHEY: I always promise them every time I go, maybe one day we'll get naming a few of you for a bit of respect, because that could have been one of us.

BUCHANAN: The Daughters of Charity have done one thing to remember the dead. Under pressure, and after some resistance, in 2004 they paid for a memorial stone to be erected at St Mary's on the ground where the children were buried. For more than a decade, campaigners believed it marked the final resting place of more than a hundred children. [MUSIC] Our findings suggest it actually commemorates the early death of at least four hundred souls. For former residents like George Quinn, the memorial's impassioned plea for the dead to be respected, remembered, means more now than ever.

#### ACTUALITY AT MEMORIAL

QUINN: We're standing in front of the memorial and there's an inscription on it and I'll read it to you: 'Their life was so short, no world to roam, taken so young they never went home, so spare a thought for them as you pass this way, a prayer if you remember, day by day.'